



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

In criticism it is possible to say that while Christ is the crown of much that is good in Hinduism, there are so many things in this religion that Christ can but destroy, and there are so many things in Christ which find no easily discovered germ in Hinduism, that one is in danger of misleading the Hindu by such a use of terms as are found in the title of this book. But in the reaction from that approach which tends ruthlessly to denounce the customs and beliefs of an ancient people, we feel it is better to err on the side of too great sympathy, rather than on the side of unappreciative criticism.

We have no hesitation in recommending this book as a thorough and illuminating exposition of Hinduism. We know of no other single book so well fitted through clearness, precision, and scholarship to give one an insight into the greatness of Hinduism, its essential errors and evils, and the way in which Christianity meets a new need that has arisen in India as the result of the whole impact of Christian civilization on her.

D. J. FLEMING

CHICAGO, ILLINOIS

THE PROPHETS OF ISRAEL

A glance at the table of contents in Buttenwieser's *The Prophets of Israel*¹ shows a somewhat unusual arrangement of materials. Amos appears, not at the beginning, but at the end of the book. Jeremiah leads the procession. The discussion of his prophecies, and of some problems suggested by his message, occupies 210 of 330 pages. Then follow two chapters on Amos' and Hosea's view of the nation's doom and a more extended discussion of "Isaiah's View of the Doom and His Attitude toward the Political Affairs of the Day." This completes the contents of Book I, subdivided into three parts and twelve chapters. The last 30 pages of the volume constitute Book II, Part I, under the general title of "The Message of the Prophets." This final discussion concerns itself chiefly with Amos and looks forward, according to the preface, to a second volume. One would naturally expect the prophets' proclamation of doom to be treated as an essential part of their message. But the author has dealt with this aspect of their work in Book I under the general title of "The Faith of the Prophets."

¹ *The Prophets of Israel from the Eighth Century to the Fifth Century. Their Faith and Their Message.* By Moses Buttenwieser. New York: Macmillan, 1914. xx+350 pages. \$2.00.

We are inclined to think that readers will find the foregoing arrangement of materials confusing, and largely because it lacks genetic coherence. Buttenwieser explains his departure from the chronological order of treatment by saying that the spiritual side of the prophetic movement can, in his view, "be best studied by starting with it at the point of its highest development." He feels convinced that literary prophecy must be considered first of all from the point of view of the prophets' personal faith in order to comply fully with the analytic-genetic method; that "only after the spiritual side has been fully considered can the doctrinal side of the movement be appreciated in its true significance." One might be tempted to infer from this statement that the author does not consider the genetic method of inquiry a necessary instrument for the determination of what the prophets' personal faith actually was. Such an inference, however, is not borne out by the excellent historical investigation which the book contains. Since the author avows himself "in full harmony with the historicocritical method of modern research," and since genetic coherence is always of advantage to the reader, the reviewer wonders whether Buttenwieser has gained as much as he has lost by abandoning chronological sequence.

Buttenwieser's best work has gone into the historical analysis of Jeremiah's prophecies. He is an independent investigator and frequently offers good and ingenious reasons for differing with Cornill, Duhm, and Giesebricht. He discards, for instance, the customary interpretation of the Deuteronomic law of prophecy (*Deut. 18:15-22*) as the product of a preconceived idea with which later ages approached vs. 22. The latter he translates: "If it happen that a prophet pronounceth in the name of YHVH that which shall not be or occur, that is the word which YHVH hath not spoken; presumptuously hath the prophet pronounced it: you shall not be afraid of him." The crucial element in the verse is the phrase "in the name of YHVH." Buttenwieser holds that the verse was expressly intended to prohibit prophetic utterances directed against the divine authority of the sacrificial cultus. The false prophet, then, is to be recognized by defiance of the Law (D) which invested the cultus with divine sanction. "To declare what is contrary to the Law might be reprehensible in itself, but to declare what is contrary to the Law in the name of YHVH, i.e., to claim divine authority for such a message, would be blasphemous" (p. 34). Jeremiah was persecuted for offending against this law.

This is only one of numerous instances that might be cited to illustrate the author's independence of judgment. His thorough equipment as a

Hebraist, and his evidently broad knowledge of oriental literature and customs make his findings especially worthy of consideration where they relate to textual analysis and interpretation. When he discusses such subjects as "Inspiration Opposed to Divination or Possession," most readers probably will find him a less reliable guide. Quotations from Schiller (in German), Wordsworth, and H. W. Mabie, however pertinent in other connections, are scarcely adequate to "bring out clearly the serious misapprehension of spiritual prophecy involved in the views of those scholars who consider the visions of Isa., chap. 6, and Jer. 1:1-10, 15-19, and the ecstasies or trances of the diviner, related phenomena." Buttenwieser attempts to show that "the inspiration of the literary prophets and the mantic possession or ecstasy of the older prophets are two distinct phenomena proceeding from radically different states of mind" (p. 160). Ezekiel is found to be an inconvenient phenomenon and is therefore refused a place "in the same category with the six great prophets, Amos, Hosea, Micah, Isaiah, Jeremiah, and Deutero-Isaiah."

We apprehend that the author has set up a thesis here which not only is incapable of proof, but is inherently improbable. Modern Old Testament scholars will sympathize strongly with his value judgments, without feeling that those judgments are endangered by a development of literary prophecy out of the ecstasy prophetism of earlier times. The evidence of historical continuity requires stronger disproof, in our judgment, than the author has advanced. But the book is interesting and valuable from various points of view. It is the work of a modern Jewish scholar whose views on the rise of monotheism, on the ethical temper of the prophets, and their antagonism to the cultus, will receive a sympathetic welcome among students of the Old Testament.

WILLIAM FREDERIC BADE

PACIFIC THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

DOCTRINAL DISCUSSIONS

Mr. Harte,¹ a young scholar of Belfast, Ireland, makes a contribution to the discussion of the possibility and the meaning of ascribing personality to God by presenting the series of modern thinkers on the subject, beginning with Spinoza. He describes the essential elements of personality as self-confidence, self-determination, desire (=appetite in

¹ *The Philosophical Treatment of Divine Personality.* By Frederick E. Harte. London: Charles H. Kelly, 1913. 156 pages. 2s. 6d.